Three-forms, and Axions: String and Particle Physics Applications

Luis Ibáñez

European Research Council

SPLE Advanced Grant

Fayet Fest ENS, Paris, December 2016 Instituto de Física Teórica UAM-CSIC, Madrid

Three-forms, and Axions: String and Particle Physics Applications

Luis Ibáñez

European Research Council

SPLE Advanced Grant

Fayet Fest ENS, Paris, December 2016 Instituto de Física Teórica UAM-CSIC, Madrid

Of course:

One of the fathers of supersymmetry

Many crucial insights...

Supersymmetry breaking...... Spontaneous symmetry breaking in SUSY.... R-parity Fayet-Iliopoulos terms...... $N=2$

SUSY phenomenology......

Light dark matter

```
ultra light U(1)'s.....
```
What some of us had to study by 1980...

PHYSICS REPORT (Section C of Physics Letters) 32, No. 5 (1977) 249-334. NORTH-HOLLAND PUBLISHING COMPANY

SUPERSYMMETRY

P. FAYET* and S. FERRARA**

Laboratoire de Physique Théorique de l'Ecole Normale Supérieure, 24 rue Lhomond, 75231 Paris Cedex 05, France

Received 2 July 1976

Contents:

G.

294

297 299 300

302

303

305

310 312

313 313 318

319

Abstract:

Supersymmetry transformations turn bosons into fermions and conversely. We discuss the algebraic aspects of the new structure, its role in relativistic quantum field theory and its possible applications to particle physics.

Suddenly 1981-1984 SUSY becomes popular !!

Emphasis on hierarchy problem

Gauge coupling unification

Coupling to supergravity induces soft terms: mSUGRA, CMSSM

Radiative $SU(2)xU(1)$ breaking

Suddenly 1981-1984 SUSY becomes popular !!

Emphasis on hierarchy problem

Gauge coupling unification

Coupling to supergravity induces soft terms: mSUGRA, CMSSM

Radiative $SU(2)xU(1)$ breaking

Still Pierre remains the father of the SUSY SM!

Later on, working in string theory, the inspiration of Pierre's work has been constant:

Two examples:

• Fayet-Iliopoulos terms in string-theory: important role in string compactification and D-brane physics and geometry

• R-parity appearing as a discrete gauge symmetry in string compactifications

I am going to talk about discrete shift symmetries:

$$
\phi \ \rightarrow \ \phi \ + \ f
$$

.....apparently unrelated to SUSY....

...we will see are related to SUSY auxiliary fields from the point of view of string theory

Three-forms, and Axions: String and Particle Physics Applications

Poincaré in 4 dimensions:

Spin : 0*,* 1*/*2*,* 1*,* 3*/*2*,* 2

8

Fermions and Gauge bosons

Spin : 0*,* 1*/*2*,* 1*,* 3*/*2*,* 2

Gravity is there

Spin : 0*,* 1*/*2*,* 1*,* 3*/*2*,* 2 Higgs found!!

Spin : 0*,* 1*/*2*,* 1*,* 3*/*2*,* 2

SUSY must exist!!

Somewhat analogous: $Parity(+)$: ϕ , $g_{\mu\nu}$ $Parity(-)$: C_0 , C^{μ} , $C^{\mu\nu}$ Bosons: Higgs Gravity Axions Gauge Axions

Somewhat analogous: $Parity(+)$: ϕ , $g_{\mu\nu}$ $Parity(-)$: C_0 , C^{μ} , $C^{\mu\nu}$, $C^{\mu\nu\rho}$ Bosons: Higgs Gravity Axions Gauge Axions

Somewhat analogous: $Parity(+)$: ϕ , $g_{\mu\nu}$ $Parity(-)$: C_0 , C^{μ} , $C^{\mu\nu}$, $C^{\mu\nu\rho}$ Bosons: Higgs Gravity Axions Gauge Axions $F_4 = dC_3$ Contributes to c.c.: Gives shift invariant masses to axions Usually ignored because it does not propagate but:

15 20 Somewhat analogous: $Parity(+)$: ϕ , $g_{\mu\nu}$ $Parity(-)$: C_0 , C^{μ} , $C^{\mu\nu}$, $C^{\mu\nu\rho}$ Bosons: Higgs Gravity Axions Gauge Axions $F_4 = dC_3$ Contributes to c.c.: -Gives shift invariant masses to axions Usually ignored because it does not propagate but: Landscape must exist !!

- The physics of Minkowski 3-forms
- Minkowski 3-forms in String Theory
- Applications: String Inflation **Relaxion** Higgs mass landscape

The physics of Minkowski 3-forms

Bosonic action of a 3-form field in 4d:

$$
S~=~ - \int d^4 x \sqrt{-g} \frac{1}{48} F_{\mu\nu\rho\sigma} F^{\mu\nu\rho\sigma}
$$

Eqs. of motion: $F_{\mu\nu\rho\sigma} = f_{\alpha\mu\nu\rho\sigma}$

no propagation...

...but contributes to the c.c...

$$
\delta \Lambda_{cc} \ = \ \sum_i |F_4^i|^2
$$

 $\int_0^1 f_0$ is constant

If embedded in string theory: Bousso, Polchinski '00

 $f_0 = nq$, $n \in \mathbb{Z}$ quantized in units of the membrane charge

17

But 3-forms also couple to membranes:

Pseudoscalars invariant under shifts 1)

$$
\phi \rightarrow \phi + f
$$

Perturbatively massless 2)

Mass from non-perturbative instanton effects 3)

Corolling axions to 3-forms

\n
$$
\mathcal{L} = -F_4^2 + \mu \phi F_4 + \dots \qquad F_4 = \epsilon_{\mu\nu\rho\sigma} F^{\mu\nu\rho\sigma}
$$
\n2*valid* OS

\nEqs. of Motion

\n
$$
V_0 = \frac{1}{2} (q + \mu \phi)^2
$$
\n2*alopen*, *Sorbo OS*, yield:

\n
$$
V(\phi)
$$
\nDiscrete gauge shift symmetry:

\n
$$
\phi \to \phi + \phi_0, \ q \to q - \mu \phi_0
$$
\n3.11

\n4.2

\n5.3

\n6.4

\n
$$
V(\phi)
$$
\n7.4

\n8.4

\n
$$
V(\phi)
$$
\n9.4

\n10.4

\n
$$
V(\phi)
$$
\n11.5

\n12.5

\n13.6

\n
$$
V(\phi)
$$
\n14.7

\n15.8

\n16.8

\n17.9

\n18.9

\n
$$
\phi \to \phi + \phi_0, \ q \to q - \mu \phi_0
$$
\n19.1

\n10.1

\n11.1

\n12.1

\n13.1

\n14.1

\n15.1

\n16.1

\n17.1

\n18.2

\n19.2

\n10.3

\n11.1

\n12.3

\n13.4

\n14.1

\n15.1

\n16.1

\n17.2

\n18.2

\n19.3

\n10.4

\n11.4

\n12.5

\n13.5

\n14.5

\n15.6

\n16.1

\n17.1

\n18.2

\n19.2

\

Coupling axions to 3-forms

$$
\mathcal{L} = -F_4^2 + \mu \phi F_4 + \dots
$$
\n
$$
F_4 = \epsilon_{\mu\nu\rho\sigma} F^{\mu\nu\rho\sigma}
$$
\nEqs. of Motion $V_0 = \frac{1}{2}(q + \mu \phi)^2$ Axion mass consistent
\nyield:
\n $V(\phi)$
\nDiscrete gauge shift symmetry:
\n $\phi \rightarrow \phi + \phi_0$, $q \rightarrow q - \mu \phi_0$
\nIt is a family (landscape) of
\npotentials parametrized $\frac{1}{2}V$, μ

One can formulate the same system in terms of a 2-form $B_{\mu\nu}$

$$
\mathcal{L} = -F_4^2 - \frac{\mu^2}{2}|dB_2 - C_3|^2 + \dots \quad ^*dB_2 = d\phi
$$

Invariant under the gauge transformation: *C*³ *eatsB*² *and becomes massive*

$$
B_2 \to B_2 + \Lambda_2 \ , \ C_3 \to C_3 + d\Lambda_2
$$

These gauge invariances protect potential from uncontrolled corrections

$$
V = c_n \frac{\phi^n}{M_U^{n-4}} \qquad \qquad \delta V = V_0 \left(\frac{V_0}{M_U^4}\right)
$$

22

 Kaloper, Sorbo 08;

Quevedo,Trugenberger 96

Dudas 14

Friday, December 9, 16

 δ

Minkowski 3-forms in String Theory
\nType IIA Orientifolds:
\n
$$
S_{RR} = -\frac{1}{8k_{10}^2} \int_{R^{1.3} \times Y} \sum_{p=0,2,4,6,8,10} G_p \wedge *_{10} G_p + \dots, \quad S_{NS} = -\frac{1}{4k_{10}^2} \int_{R^{1.3} \times Y} e^{-2\phi} H_3 \wedge *_{10} H_3
$$
\ndemocracformation Bergshoef et al. (later Poincare duality imposed)
\n**Gauge invariant field strengths:**
\n
$$
G_p = dC_{p-1} - H_3 \wedge C_{p-3} + Fe^B \qquad H_3 = dB_2, F_p = dC_{p-1}
$$
\n**4-forms come from dimensionally reducing higher dimensional**
\n**RR and NS p-forms:** $F_p = F_4 \wedge \omega_{p-4} + \langle F \rangle \omega_p$
\n
$$
\omega_1
$$
\n**Minkowski 4-form Internal flux**

$$
(2h_{11}^- + 2) F'_4s \text{ from RR sector :}
$$

\n
$$
F_0 = -m, F_2 = \sum_i q_i \omega_i, F_4 = F_4^0 + \sum_i e_i \tilde{\omega}_i
$$

\n
$$
F_6 = \sum_i F_4^i \omega_i + e_0 \text{dvol}_6, F_8 = \sum_i F_4^a \tilde{\omega}_a, F_{10} = F_4^m \text{dvol}_6
$$

\n
$$
e_0, e_i, q_i, m \text{ RR quadrized fluxes}
$$

 $(h_{21}^+ + 1)$ H'_4s *from NS sector* :

$$
H_7 = \sum_{I} H_4^I \wedge \alpha_I \qquad H_3 = \sum_{I=0}^{h_{2,1}^-} h_I \beta_I \qquad h_I \, NS \, quantized \, fluxes
$$

$$
Axi on S : B_2 = \sum_i b_i \omega_i , \quad C_3 = \sum_l c_3^I \alpha_I \qquad \qquad \int_Y \omega_\alpha \wedge \tilde{\omega}^\beta = \delta_\alpha^\beta , \qquad \alpha, \beta \in \{1 \dots h_+^{(1,1)}\}
$$

\n
$$
NS \qquad \qquad \begin{aligned}\n& \int_Y \omega_\alpha \wedge \tilde{\omega}^\beta = \delta_\alpha^\beta , \qquad \alpha, \beta \in \{1 \dots h_+^{(1,1)}\} \\
& \int_Y \omega_\alpha \wedge \tilde{\omega}^b = \delta_\alpha^b , \qquad a, b \in \{1 \dots h_-^{(1,1)}\} \\
& \int_Y \alpha_K \wedge \beta^L = \delta_K^L , \qquad K, L \in \{1 \dots h_-^{(2,1)} + 1\}\n\end{aligned}
$$

$$
(2h_{11}^- + 2) \quad F_4's \quad from \quad RR \, sector:
$$
\n
$$
F_0 = -m \quad F_2 = \sum q_i \omega_i \quad F_4 = F_4^0 + \sum_i e_i \tilde{\omega}_i
$$
\n
$$
F_6 = \sum_i F_4^i \omega_i + e_0 \omega_0 \omega_6 \quad F_8 = \sum_i F_4^a \tilde{\omega}_a \quad F_{10} = F_4^m \omega_0 l_6
$$
\n
$$
e_0, e_i, q_i, m \, RR \, quantized \, fluxes
$$

 $(h_{21}^+ + 1)$ H'_4s *from NS sector* :

$$
H_7 = \sum_{I} H_4^I \wedge \alpha_I \qquad H_3 = \sum_{I=0}^{h_{2,1}^-} h_I \beta_I \qquad h_I \, NS \, quantized \, fluxes
$$

$$
Axi on S : B_2 = \sum_i b_i \omega_i , \quad C_3 = \sum_l c_3^I \alpha_I \qquad \qquad \int_Y \omega_\alpha \wedge \tilde{\omega}^\beta = \delta_\alpha^\beta , \qquad \alpha, \beta \in \{1 \dots h_+^{(1,1)}\}
$$

\n
$$
NS \qquad \qquad \begin{aligned}\n& \int_Y \omega_\alpha \wedge \tilde{\omega}^\beta = \delta_\alpha^\beta , \qquad \alpha, \beta \in \{1 \dots h_+^{(1,1)}\} \\
& \int_Y \omega_\alpha \wedge \tilde{\omega}^b = \delta_\alpha^b , \qquad a, b \in \{1 \dots h_-^{(1,1)}\} \\
& \int_Y \alpha_K \wedge \beta^L = \delta_K^L , \qquad K, L \in \{1 \dots h_-^{(2,1)} + 1\}\n\end{aligned}
$$

Bieleman,L.I., Valenzuela 15;

Full scalar potential in terms of 4-forms+local terms:

$$
V = \frac{k}{2}|F_4^0|^2 + 2k\sum_{ij}g_{ij}F_4^iF_4^j + \frac{1}{8k}\sum_{ab}g_{ab}F_4^aF_4^b + k|F_4^m|^2 + \frac{1}{2s^2}\sum_{IJ}c_{IJ}H_4^IH_4^J + V_{loc}
$$

Sort of generalized Kaloper-Sorbo structure:

$$
V_{loc} = \sum_{a} \int_{\Sigma} T_a \sqrt{-g} \ e^{-\phi}
$$

$$
*_4F_4^0 = \frac{1}{k}(e_0 + e_i b^i + \frac{1}{2}k_{ijk}q^i b^j b^k - \frac{m}{3!}k_{ijk}b^i b^j b^k - h_0 c_3^0 - h_i c_3^i)
$$

$$
*_4F_4^i = \frac{g^{ij}}{4k}(e_j + k_{ijk}b^j q^k - \frac{m}{2}k_{ijk}b^j b^k)
$$

$$
*_4F_4^a = 4kg^{ab}(q_b - mb_b)
$$

$$
*_4F_4^m = -m
$$

$$
*_4H_4^I = h^I
$$

All axion dependence goes through 3-forms 4-forms act as auxiliary fields

Generalized shift symmetries $\delta N S: b_i \rightarrow b_i + n_i$ $RR: c_3^I \rightarrow c_3^I + n^I$ Axion shifts...

 $m \rightarrow m$ $e_0 \rightarrow e_0 + h_I n_I$ $q_i \rightarrow q_i + n_i m$ $e_i \rightarrow e_i - k_{ijk} q^j n^k$...compensated by flux shifts... $e_0 \rightarrow e_0 - e_i n_i$

transformations leave all 4 *forms invariant for any IIA CY orientifold VRR* + *VNS invariant*

Some lessons:

The flux-induced scalar potential of Type IIA and IIB can be written as

$$
V = \sum_{i} Z_{ij} (Re M_a) F_4^i F_4^j + \sum_{i} F_4^i \Theta_i (Im M_a) + V_{local} (Re M_a)
$$

where all the dependence on axionic fields comes through couplings to Minkowski 3-form fields.

Ecs. motion: $*_4F_4^i = Z^{ij} \Theta^j (Re M_a, Im M_a)$ $V_{4-forms} = \sum_{i,j} Z_{ij} F_4^i F_4^j + V_{local}$ *Bieleman,L.I., Valenzuela 15;* Shift symmetries force potential axion dependence only through 4-forms A N=1sugra formulation where auxiliary fields are 4 forms seems appropriate...not much studied.... Gates et al. '81 Ovrut et al. '97

28

Louis et al. '13

Applications

1) Application to large field inflation

Chaotic Inflation Linde 88

 $V(\phi) = \mu^{4-p} \phi^p$

 $N_* \simeq$ 1 2*p* $\int \phi_*$ M_p \setminus^2 $\rightarrow trans-Planckian$

Is there a consistent string embeding?

30

Silverstein, Westphal 08; McAllister,Silverstein, Westphal Kaloper, Sorbo 08 Marchesano, Shiu, Uranga , 14

Monodromy inflation

Simplest:

 $V_0 = \frac{1}{2}(q + \mu \phi)^2$ Chaotic

 $\delta V~\simeq$ ϕ^n $M_p^n \begin{cases} 4 \end{cases}$

 $\delta V \; \simeq \; V_0$ $\sqrt{V_0}$ M_p^4 \sqrt{n} $\ll V_0$

Simplest:

 $\delta V~\simeq$

 ϕ^n

$$
V_0 = \frac{1}{2} (q + \mu \phi)^2
$$
 Chaotic

 $\sqrt{V_0}$

 \sqrt{n}

 $M_p^n \begin{cases} 4 \end{cases}$ M_p^4 $\ll V_0$ There are however in general flattening effects: Quadratic potential is probably ruled out by Planck+BICEP !! $E.g.$ *if inflaton is aD – brane modulus*: *Silverstein, Westphal 08; McAllister,Silverstein, Westphal*

 $\delta V \; \simeq \; V_0$

÷

32

 $\mathcal{L}_{DBI} = -[1 + aV(\phi)]\partial_{\mu}\phi\partial^{\mu}\bar{\phi} - V(\phi)$

 $V \simeq \phi^n \longrightarrow V' \simeq (\phi')$ *Gur-Ari, 13 Bieleman,L.I.,Pedro,Valenzuela ,Wieck 16; L.I.,Marchesano,Valenzuela*

2*n/*(*n*+2) OK with Planck-BICEP!

2) Cosmological Relaxation $^{2}+\Lambda^{4}(h)\cos\left(\frac{\phi}{f}\right)$ ◆ $V = V(\mu\phi) + (-M^2 + \mu\phi)|h|$ *. f* $V(\mu \phi) = \mu M^2 \phi + \mu^2 \phi^2 + ... \qquad M = \text{cut-off}$ *Slow roll dictated by* $V(\mu\phi)$ $V(\phi)$ *Higgs becomes massless* Ó *Higgs stopped by* $\Lambda(h)^4 \cos \left(\frac{\phi}{f} \right)$ ◆ *f* $\mu f M^2 \simeq \Lambda^4 (h = v)$ [Graham, Kaplan, Rajendran' 15] $\sqrt{2}$ $\frac{\Lambda^4}{f M^2} \simeq 10^{-18} \left(\frac{10^{10} GeV}{f}\right)$ ◆ ✓*M^W* $\mu\simeq$ *GeV* tiny!! *M* 33

.

Consistency problems for relaxation

Hierarchy traded for a tiny value of µ Technically natural due to axion φ shift symmetry

• Enormous trans-Planckian excursions of the axion: is the potential stable? A global shift symmetry not immune to gravitational corrections.

• If it is gauged, a non-vanishing axion potential $V(\mu\phi)$ explicitly breaks the gauge shift symmetry, which is inconsistent. [Gupta,Komargodski,Perez,Ubaldi'15]

34 Problems analogous to those of large field inflation: Can one build a consistent monodromy-like relaxion model?

A minimal 3-form relaxion model

L.I.,Montero,Uranga,Valenzuela , 15

(no string theory needed here)

$$
V = V_{SM} + V_{KS} - \eta F_4 |H|^2 + V_{cos}
$$

\n
$$
V_{SM} = -m^2 |H|^2 + \lambda |H|^4 \qquad V_{KS} = F_4^2 - \mu \phi F_4
$$

\n
$$
V = \tilde{\lambda} |H|^4 + (q + \mu \phi)^2 + 2\eta (-M^2 + \mu \phi) |H|^2 + V_{cos}
$$

\n
$$
\downarrow
$$

\n
$$
V(\mu \phi) \qquad \text{relaxion - Higgs coupling}
$$

\n
$$
Cut - off: M^2 = \frac{m^2}{2\eta} - q
$$

35

Features of relaxion monodromy

L.I.,Montero,Uranga,Valenzuela , 15

• Shift gauge symmetry is respected by the relaxion potential.

• Potential protected against Planck-supressed and loop corrections:

$$
\delta V \simeq V_0 \left(\frac{V_0}{M^4}\right)^n \simeq V_0 \left(\frac{\Lambda^4}{M^4}\right)^n \ll V_0
$$

•Scales:

 $F_4 = n \Lambda_k^2$; $\mu \simeq$ Λ_k^2 $2\pi f$ $\mu \simeq 10^{-34}$ *GeV* $\longrightarrow \Lambda_k \simeq 10^{-3} eV$

Anything to do with the c.c.?

3) A Higgs landscape of Higgs masses
\nUse 4-forms to construct a landscape of Higgs masses
\n
$$
\mathcal{L} = -\frac{1}{2}(F_a)^2 - \frac{1}{2}(F_h)^2 + \phi(\mu_a F_a + \mu_h F_h) + \eta F_h |H|^2
$$
\n(no string theory assumed here)
\n
$$
V = \frac{1}{2}|f_0^a + \mu\phi|^2 + \frac{1}{2}|f_0^h + \mu^h\phi + \eta\sigma^2|^2 - m^2\sigma^2 + \lambda\sigma^4
$$
\nDifferent from Pelaring NQ cosmological rolling of the

axion here! Different from Relaxion: INO cosmological rolling of the

Can fine-tune the Higgs vev in steps: $m_h, m_a \in \mathbb{Z}$ $q_a = \mu f$ $\delta(\sigma^2) = \frac{\eta\mu f}{(2\lambda + \eta^2\cos^2\theta)} \frac{q_aq_h}{q_a^2 + q_h^2}(m_a - m_h)$ $q_h = \mu^h f$ $\cos^2\theta = \frac{(\mu)^2}{\mu^2 + (\mu^h)^2}$ $\delta(\sigma^2) \simeq \eta \mu f = \eta q_a \leq m_H^2$ EW fine-tuning connected to 4-form quanta and coupling η Large family of SM vacua with different Higgs masses and vevs Antropic selection of correct EW vacua

Prediction: a Hierarxion Pseudoscalar with a mass:

$$
4.7 \ \eta^{-3/2} \ 10^{-3} eV \left(\frac{10^{10} GeV}{f}\right) \left(\frac{m}{10^{10} GeV}\right)^{3/2} \ \lesssim m_{arion} \ \lesssim \ \eta^{-1} \ 10^{3} eV \ \left(\frac{10^{10} GeV}{f}\right) \tag{9.90}
$$

 3.29

For $\eta \simeq 1$ and $f \simeq m \simeq 10^{10}$ GeV one has $10^{-3} eV \lesssim m_{axion} \lesssim 10^{3} eV$

one can have ultralight axions with $m_{axion} \simeq 10^{-17}$ eV

Difficult to identify with QCD axion though... Couplings to photons model dependent...

Possible to construct SUSY versions: the 4-forms are now part of the SUSY auxiliary fields

Conclusions

• 3-forms appear naturaly as new degrees of freedom in field theory. The field-strength is a 4-form which contributes to vacuum energy.

• 3-forms couple to membranes. Values of 4-forms change discretely while going through a membrane in units of the membrane charge.

• 3-forms can couple to axions and can give them a mass while mantaining the axion discrete shift symmetry. The scalar potential is necesarily a power expansion in 4-forms. Makes the axion potential stable.

• The field strength 4-forms appear naturally in String Theory from reduction of RR and NS higher dimensional antisymmetric tensors. The 4-forms are in bijection with internal fluxes and are quantized in units of membrane charges.

• The full NS and RR axion potential can be written in terms of 4 forms that act as auxiliary fields. In SUSY compactifications the 4 forms behave like SUSY auxiliary fields of Kahler and c.s. chiral μ *multiplets.* $F_{aux}^{SUSY} \rightarrow \epsilon_{\mu\nu\rho\sigma} F^{\mu\nu\rho\sigma}$

• Axions in string theory are 'monodromy axions' with associated 3 forms. This makes the scalar potentials for axions stable even upon trans-Planckian trips. And makes string axions to be promising inflatons in large field.

• One can construct consistent 'relaxion models' involving 3-forms. They address some of the problems.... First attempts to embed in string theory, challenging.

One can also construct a Higgs mass landscape from quantized 4-forms.

IS SUSY ALIVE AND WELL?

Instituto de Física Teórica UAM-CSIC Madrid, 28-30 September 2016

https://workshops.ift.uam-csic.es/susyaaw

SPEAKERS

B. Allanach (Cambridge U.) H. Baer (Oklahoma U.) G. Bélanger (LAPTH-Annecy) O. Buchmüller (Imperial Coll.) M. Carena (Fermilab) M. Cicoli (ICTP & Bologna U.) H. Dreiner (Bonn U.)

J. Ellis (CERN & King's Coll.) L. J. Hall (Berkeley) A. Katz (CERN & Geneva U.) J. Lykken (Fermilab) J. March-Russell (Oxford U.) F. Moortgat (CMS-CERN) P. Ramond (Florida U.)

G. G. Ross (Oxford U.) X. Tata (Hawaii U.) D. Shih (Rutgers U.) F. Staub (CERN) A. Strumia (CERN & Pisa U.) I. Vivarelli (ATLAS-Sussex U.) A. Weiler (Munich)

Discussion convener: **X. Tata (Hawaii U.)**

43